



City of Carlsbad

Office of the City Manager

February 26, 2009

DOCKET

07-AFC-6

DATE FEB 26 2009

RECD. FEB 26 2009

Mike Monasmith
Siting Project Manager
California Energy Commission
1516 Ninth Street, MS-15
Sacramento, CA 95814

**Re: CARLSBAD ENERGY CENTER PROJECT (07-AFC-6)
NORTH COUNTY TIMES EDITORIAL**

Dear Mr. Monasmith:

On behalf of the City of Carlsbad, please find the enclosed North County Times editorial for docketing. This recent article, dated February 25, 2009, highlights many of the challenges that face the Carlsbad Energy Center Project.

This correspondence will be submitted to all interested parties and pursuant to the attached proof of service.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Joe Garuba".

Joe Garuba
Municipal Projects Manager

JG:ad

Enclosure

cc: Proof of Service List (Revised 2/18/2009)



Last modified Wednesday, February 25, 2009 12:12 AM PST

ARNOLD: Case tips against NRG power plant

By THOMAS K. ARNOLD

The city of Carlsbad may have found a new ally in its efforts to prevent power giant NRG from building additional power units adjacent to its existing smoke-bellowing eyesore across the coast highway from the beach.

In a Feb. 5 letter to the California Energy Commission, Allan Kosup, Caltrans' point person in the widening of Interstate 5, warns that NRG's proposal to significantly increase its power-plant footprint could clash with Caltrans' plans to widen the freeway.

"It is critical that the proposed Carlsbad Energy Center Project does not preclude, interfere with, or unduly restrict existing or the planned future expansion of I-5 and the double-tracking of the Los Angeles to San Diego Rail Corridor," he writes. The freeway widening would require the removal of the earthen berm, with its towering eucalyptus trees, that currently shields part of the existing plant from the freeway, he adds ---- and the location of the proposed new power complex wouldn't leave enough room for a replacement berm.

□ That's a no-go as far as Caltrans is concerned, according to Kosup, and not just because of "significant adverse cumulative visual impacts."

"It should be noted that concerns raised regarding the potential for errant vehicles impacting the plant are typically addressed through placement of a barrier at the edge of the I-5 traveled way," he adds.

So now it's a safety issue, as well.

My question: How much longer can the California Energy Commission, in good faith, continue to support NRG's plans to build a massive new power plant complex next to its current facility, in the face of mounting evidence that such a project simply doesn't belong there?

We already know the new generation of plants don't require ocean water to cool their generators, so there's no reason in the world NRG needs to build its new power complex on the coast. We only have so much shoreline to go around, and devoting 95 acres to heavy industry is a waste, plain and simple□□"particularly when it's situated smack-dab in the middle of one of the most scenic stretches of coastline on the entire West Coast.

We also know NRG's new plant can hardly be considered green. With a new president committed to clean, renewable energy sources, is an old-school plant really a smart thing to build? The new power complex will produce an estimated 850,000 metric tons of greenhouse gases a year, the same amount as a city of 60,000 people, according to NRG's own

environmental documents. And it should be noted that while NRG fights to build its first new power unit, with a capacity of 540 megawatts, a company in central California is gearing up for a solar-powered facility that will generate even more electricity.

OptiSolar late last year announced the inking of a 550-megawatt solar power agreement with Pacific Gas & Electric for clean, renewable power from its TopazSolar Farm. The project, in San Luis Obispo County, will be the largest photovoltaic solar project in the world.

As for an economic argument, there isn't any. NRG's proposed new power complex has no long-term job creation and could have a very negative impact on North County's tourism industry.

And to those who dare accuse the city, and the citizens, of Carlsbad of NIMBYism, consider this: It's a regional issue, not a Carlsbad issue. Further industrial blight along our precious North County coastline affects everyone.

During my recent campaign for a seat on the Carlsbad City Council I spent a lot of time on the sidewalk along Carlsbad Boulevard, asking people if they were Carlsbad voters.

More than half said no ---- and the vast majority of them were from Oceanside.

Thomas K. Arnold writes from Carlsbad. Contact him at TKARNOLD@aol.com.



**BEFORE THE ENERGY RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT
COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
1516 NINTH STREET, SACRAMENTO, CA 95814
1-800-822-6228 – WWW.ENERGY.CA.GOV**

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATION
FOR THE CARLSBAD ENERGY
CENTER PROJECT**

Docket No. 07-AFC-6

**PROOF OF SERVICE
(Revised 2/18/2009)**

APPLICANT

David Lloyd
Carlsbad Energy Center, LLC
1817 Aston Avenue, Suite 104
Carlsbad, CA 92008
David.Lloyd@nrgenergy.com

Tim Hemig, Vice President
Carlsbad Energy Center, LLC
1817 Aston Avenue, Suite 104
Carlsbad, CA 92008
Tim.Hemig@nrgenergy.com

APPLICANT'S CONSULTANTS

Robert Mason, Project Manager
CH2M Hill, Inc.
6 Hutton Centre Drive, Ste. 700
Santa Ana, CA 92707
Robert.Mason@ch2m.com

Megan Sebra
CH2M Hill, Inc.
2485 Natomas Park Drive, Ste. 600
Sacramento, CA 95833
Megan.Sebra@ch2m.com

COUNSEL FOR APPLICANT

John A. McKinsey
Stoel Rives LLP
980 Ninth Street, Ste. 1900
Sacramento, CA 95814
jamckinsey@stoel.com

INTERESTED AGENCIES

California ISO
e-recipient@caiso.com

INTERVENORS

City of Carlsbad
Allan J. Thompson
Attorney for the City
21 "C" Orinda Way #314
Orinda, CA 94563
allanori@comcast.net

City of Carlsbad
Joseph Garuba, Municipals Project
Manager
Ron Ball, Esq., City Attorney
1200 Carlsbad Village Drive
Carlsbad, CA 92008
jgaru@ci.carlsbad.ca.us
rball@ci.carlsbad.ca.us

Terramar Association
Kerry Siekmann & Catherine Miller
5239 El Arbol
Carlsbad, CA 92008
siekmann1@att.net

California Unions for Reliable Energy
("CURE")
Gloria D. Smith & Marc D. Joseph
Adams Broadwell Joseph & Cardozo
601 Gateway Boulevard, Suite 1000
South San Francisco, CA 94080
gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com

Center for Biological Diversity
c/o William B. Rostov
EARTHJUSTICE
426 17th St., 5th Floor
Oakland, CA 94612
wrostov@earthjustice.org

Power of Vision
Julie Baker and Arnold Roe, Ph.D.
P.O. Box 131302
Carlsbad, California 92013
powerofvision@roadrunner.com

Rob Simpson
Environmental Consultant
27126 Grandview Avenue
Hayward CA 94542
rob@redwoodrob.com

ENERGY COMMISSION

JAMES D. BOYD
Vice Chair and Presiding Member
jboyd@energy.state.ca.us

KAREN DOUGLAS
Commissioner and Associate Member
kldougla@energy.state.ca.us

Paul Kramer
Hearing Officer
pkramer@energy.state.ca.us

Mike Monasmi
Siting Project Manager
mmonasmi@energy.state.ca.us

Dick Ratliff
Staff Counsel
dratliff@energy.state.ca.us

Elena Miller
Public Adviser's Office
publicadviser@energy.state.ca.us

DECLARATION OF SERVICE

I, Andrea Dykes, declare that on February 26, 2009, I served and filed copies of the attached document re:North County Times Editorial.

The original document, filed with the Docket Unit, is accompanied by a copy of the most recent Proof of Service list, located on the web page for this project at:

[<http://www.energy.ca.gov/sitingcases/carlsbad/index.html>]. The document has been sent to both the other parties in this proceeding (as shown on the Proof of Service list) and to the Commission's Docket Unit, in the following manner:

(Check all that Apply)

For service to all other parties:

sent electronically to all email addresses on the Proof of Service list;

by personal delivery or by depositing in the United States mail at Sacramento, California with first-class postage thereon fully prepaid and addressed as provided on the Proof of Service list above to those addresses **NOT** marked "email preferred."

AND

For filing with the Energy Commission:

sending an original paper copy and one electronic copy, mailed and emailed respectively, to the address below (preferred method);

OR

depositing in the mail an original and 12 paper copies, as follows:

CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION

Attn: Docket No. 07-AFC-6
1516 Ninth Street, MS-4
Sacramento, CA 95814-5512
docket@energy.state.ca.us

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

