



980 Ninth Street, Suite 1900  
Sacramento, California 95814  
main 916.447.0700  
fax 916.447.4781  
www.stoel.com

January 16, 2009

DENISE M. MORISON  
Direct (916) 319-4755  
dmmorison@stoel.com

**VIA HAND DELIVERY AND PER PROOF OF SERVICE**

J. Mike Monasmith  
Siting Project Manager  
California Energy Commission  
1516 Ninth Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814

<b>DOCKET</b>	
<b>07-AFC-6</b>	
DATE	JAN 16 2009
RECD.	JAN 16 2009

**Re: Carlsbad Energy Center Project (07-AFC-6)**  
**Editorial Publications from The San Diego Union-Tribune and North Coast Times**

Dear Mr. Monasmith:

Please find enclosed herein for docketing two editorial publications related to the Carlsbad Energy Center Project. These editorials will be provided to all parties identified on the attached proof of service.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "DMorison".

Denise M. Morison  
Case Assistant

DMM:dmm

Enclosures

cc: See Proof of Service

Wednesday, January 7, 2009 12:10 AM PST

EDITORIAL: Coastal power plant idea best fix for Carlsbad

By North County Times Opinion staff

The quickest, best way for the city of Carlsbad to see the redevelopment of beachfront land that is now home to a power plant is the very proposal against which the city is waging a public relations campaign.

As a result, we expect a full house today and Thursday at the two-day public workshop by a state agency on a proposal to build a new power-generating plant farther away from the beach.

In mid-December, the California Energy Commission's staff released its preliminary assessment of the plan ---- a review that was mostly favorable, but noted a few concerns we believe can be resolved.

We believe California's energy regulators should clear the way for the construction of NRG Energy Inc.'s proposed plant between Interstate 5 and the coastal railroad tracks, and urge the company to stick with its plan to eventually demolish the existing but antiquated Encina.

The company's proposal would result in a lower-profile structure, away from the shoreline, leaving 67 acres available for it to sell or develop on its own as a possible beachfront hotel-resort.

And while the benefits to Carlsbad are huge in replacing the older plant with a newer, more efficient, less polluting and lower-profile facility, the city is still not pleased.

It is no secret that Carlsbad wants to have the entire 92-acre oceanfront site for a hotel/resort development instead. But no amount of wishing is going to get NRG off its land, and other city-offered sites have been deemed unacceptable. And apparently, the city does not want the land strongly enough to try to buy it from NRG.

But the longer the city battles, the longer the delay in getting Encina replaced and removed.

Moreover, the issue is not one requiring city approval. The power plant's fate is firmly in the hands of state regulators.

We encourage the attendance of those who wish to participate in the workshops. We are sure the more you learn, the more you will agree that NRG's plan is the best for it, the city and the residents of North County.

**If you want to attend:**

Workshops on NRG's power plant proposal will be held 10 a.m. to 7 p.m. Wednesday and 11 a.m. to 5 p.m. Thursday, at the Sheraton Carlsbad, 5480 Grand Pacific Drive, Carlsbad.

# The San Diego Union-Tribune.

UNION-TRIBUNE EDITORIAL

Powering up

A good plan to upgrade, move Encina plant

August 25, 2008

Since there are few unobjectionable sites for power plants, finding suitable sites is fraught with hazards. For this region, the hazard is not finding enough sites to generate reliable power.

NRG Energy has found its optimum site for replacing its Encina plant, which now sits on company-owned beachfront property adjacent to the Agua Hedionda Lagoon in Carlsbad. Half a century old, the plant still works – using seawater cooling – and could last another 15 years. But the plant is woefully inefficient. Seawater-cooled power plants are being phased out by federal order. And with a smokestack 400 feet tall, this plant is a blight on the ocean view for miles around.

The new site for the plant is company-owned property east and south of the lagoon, between railroad tracks and Interstate 5, a parcel suited to industrial use and not much else. The profile of the new plant and its two smokestacks, called the Carlsbad Energy Center, would be far less intrusive. And the power generation would be state-of-the-art.

If the California Energy Commission approves the plan, NRG can begin phasing out the old plant, which must be kept in running condition at least until the new plant begins generation, and thereafter only if California's Independent System Operator approves.

Obtaining permits will take three to five years, and construction will take two years. So, the sooner the energy commission approves NRG's site, the sooner the region is better off.

Carlsbad officials are not happy with NRG's plans. While the city is more than willing, officials say, to house a power plant within its boundaries, they object to keeping the plant on the coast. Since a new power plant won't need ocean water for cooling, officials asked that the Coastal Commission intervene to prohibit this new, noncoastal-dependent use. With rare restraint, the commission declined to intervene.

Yet just last week the City Council again urged moving the plant off NRG's coastal property to one of several sites well inland. The development of a hotel, shops or parks on that 100 acres of NRG's coastal property would offer, city officials say, "much greater direct public benefit to the Carlsbad community" and constitute a more appropriate land use.

Yet which among Carlsbad's plentiful pleasant neighborhoods would accept a power plant anywhere nearby without mounting an effort to stop or at least delay it? In any case, NRG finds none of Carlsbad's alternative locations feasible. The company has said, however, that it may consider development of the prime acreage that becomes available when the new plant is in full operation and the old plant closed.

Fortunately for the region, the state energy commission has not only the final say on the new plant's location. It also has the expertise to understand how fragile the current power base is in this region and the potentially severe impact of inordinate delay. Residents of San Diego, including Carlsbad, should not have to experience the severe consequences to their lives and livelihoods of a prolonged lapse in power to appreciate NRG's plan.



BEFORE THE ENERGY RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT  
COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
1516 NINTH STREET, SACRAMENTO, CA 95814  
1-800-822-6228 — [WWW.ENERGY.CA.GOV](http://WWW.ENERGY.CA.GOV)

APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATION  
FOR THE **CARLSBAD ENERGY  
CENTER PROJECT**

Docket No. 07-AFC-6  
PROOF OF SERVICE  
(Revised 1/12/2009)

**CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION**  
Attn: Docket No. 07-AFC-6  
1516 Ninth Street, MS-15  
Sacramento, CA 95814-5512  
[docketenemy.state.ca.us](http://docketenemy.state.ca.us)

**APPLICANT**

David Lloyd  
Carlsbad Energy Center, LLC  
1817 Aston Avenue, Suite 104  
Carlsbad, CA 92008  
[David.Lloyd@energycv.com](mailto:David.Lloyd@energycv.com)

Tim Hemig, Vice President  
Carlsbad Energy Center, LLC  
1817 Aston Avenue, Suite 104  
Carlsbad, CA 92008  
[Tim.Hemig@menerow.com](mailto:Tim.Hemig@menerow.com)

**APPLICANT'S CONSULTANTS**

Robert Mason, Project Manager  
CH2M Hill, Inc.  
6 Hutton Centre Drive, Ste. 700  
Santa Ana, CA 92707  
[Robert.Mason@ch2m.com](mailto:Robert.Mason@ch2m.com)

Megan Sebra  
CH2M Hill, Inc.  
2485 Natomas Park Drive, Ste. 600  
Sacramento, CA 95833  
[Megan.Sebra@ch2m.com](mailto:Megan.Sebra@ch2m.com)

**COUNSEL FOR APPLICANT**

John A. McKinsey  
Stoel Rives LLP  
980 Ninth Street, Ste. 1900  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
[jamckinsevastael.com](http://jamckinsevastael.com)

**INTERESTED AGENCIES**

California ISO  
P.O. Box 639014  
Folsom, CA 95763-9014  
(e-mail preferred) [e-recipient@caiso.com](mailto:e-recipient@caiso.com)

**INTERVENORS**

\*City of Carlsbad  
Allan J. Thompson  
Attorney for the City  
21 "C" Orinda Way #314  
Orinda, CA 94563  
[allanori@comcast.net](mailto:allanori@comcast.net)

\*City of Carlsbad  
Joseph Garuba, Municipals Project Manager  
Ron Ball, Esq., City Attorney  
1200 Carlsbad Village Drive  
Carlsbad, CA 92008  
[jgaruad@carlsbad.ca.us](mailto:jgaruad@carlsbad.ca.us); [rballa@ci.carlsbad.ca.us](mailto:rballa@ci.carlsbad.ca.us)  
[rball@ci.carlsbad.ca.us](mailto:rball@ci.carlsbad.ca.us)

Terramar Association  
Kery Siekmann & Catherine Miller  
5239 El Arbol  
Carlsbad, CA 92008  
[siekmannleatt.net](http://siekmannleatt.net)

California Unions for Reliable Energy ("CURE")  
Gloria D. Smith & Marc D. Joseph  
Adams Broadwell Joseph & Cardozo  
601 Gateway Boulevard, Suite 1000  
South San Francisco, CA 94080

[gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com](mailto:gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com)

Center for Biological Diversity  
do William B. Rostov  
EARTHJUSTICE  
426 17th St., 5th Floor  
Oakland, CA 94612  
[wrostovaeearthjustice.org](http://wrostovaeearthjustice.org)

Power of Vision  
Julie Baker and Arnold Roe, Ph.D.  
P.O. Box 131302  
Carlsbad, California 92013  
[powerofvisionsoadrunner.com](http://powerofvisionsoadrunner.com)

Rob Simpson  
Environmental Consultant  
27126 Grandview Avenue  
Hayward CA 94542  
[robaredwood.rob.com](http://robaredwood.rob.com)

#### **ENERGY COMMISSION**

JAMES D. BOYD  
Vice Chair and Presiding Member  
[jboyde.energy.state.ca.us](mailto:jboyde.energy.state.ca.us)

KAREN DOUGLAS  
Commissioner and Associate Member  
[kdougl@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:kdougl@energy.state.ca.us)

Paul Kramer  
Hearing Officer  
[pkramere.energy.state.ca.us](mailto:pkramere.energy.state.ca.us)

Mike Monasmith  
Siting Project Manager  
[mmonasmie@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:mmonasmie@energy.state.ca.us)

Dick Ratliff  
Staff Counsel  
[dratliff@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:dratliff@energy.state.ca.us)

Elena Miller  
Public Adviser's Office  
[publicadviser@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:publicadviser@energy.state.ca.us)

#### **DECLARATION OF SERVICE**

I, Denise Morison, declare that on January 16, 2009, I deposited copies of the attached editorial Publications from The San Diego Union-Tribune and North Coast Times in the United States mail at 980 Ninth Street, Suite 1900, Sacramento, California 95814, with first-class postage thereon fully prepaid and addressed to those identified on the Proof of Service list above.

**OR**

Transmission via electronic mail was consistent with the requirements of California Code of Regulations, title 20, sections 1209, 1209.5, and 1210. All electronic copies were sent to all those identified on the Proof of Service list above.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Denise M. Morison